



Course Syllabus Wycliffe College Toronto School of Theology

This description is intended to assist in the course approval process and to assist students in determining whether this course will help them achieve their educational objectives and the learning goals of their program. It is not a learning contract. The details of the description are subject to change before the course begins. The course syllabus will be available to the class at the beginning of the course.

Course Identification

Course Number : WYT3502HS/WYT6502HS
 Course Name: Atonement and Sacrifice: A Theological Inquiry
 Campus: St. George

Instructor Information

Instructor: Joseph Mangina
 E-mail: joseph.mangina@wycliffe.utoronto.ca
 Office Hours:

Course Prerequisites or Requisites

Give the course code and title of any pre-requisite or requisite courses.

Course Description

This course seeks to explore the concept of atonement or reconciliation in Christian theology, especially (though not exclusively) as it relates to questions of cult, sacrifice, and offering. Readings will include both classic and modern authors, with some attention being paid to the critique of substitution/sacrificial models of atonement as inherently violent, as well as to postmodern discussions concerning the logic of gift-giving and exchange. The goal of the course is to help students articulate a coherent “theology of the cross” within a broader context of theological understanding.

Course Methodology

Seminar, readings, weekly summaries, discussion, final paper

Course Outcomes

COURSE OUTCOMES	COURSE ELEMENT	PROGRAM OUTCOMES
By the end of this course, students	This outcome will be achieved through these course elements:	This course outcome corresponds to these aspects of Wycliffe’s statements of outcomes (MTS, MDiv)
• will become familiar with some of the historic issues	Lectures, readings	MTS: 1.3, 1.2

<p>revolving around theological discussion of atonement and sacrifice, through engagement with selected classic authors and modern thinkers.</p> <p>Indirectly, the course will also help students to deal more readily with scriptural texts on these themes, e.g. Leviticus, Hebrews, Galatians, and other parts of the Pauline corpus. Mastery of both biblical and theological content will be demonstrated through seminar discussion and the final paper.;</p>		MDiv: 1.3, 1.2
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • will grapple with some of the major ecumenical issues involved in the topic of atonement and sacrifice, e.g. the question of eucharistic sacrifice; 	Course as a whole, but especially discussion, final paper	MTS: 1.3, 2.1, 2.3 MDiv: 1.3, 2.1, 2.2
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • will reflect theologically on atonement as a necessary element within what may be called the “cruciform life.” The practice of the church and of Christian living (e.g. the life of prayer) are constantly presupposed in this course. We will constantly be alert for the consequences of atonement theologies on Christian existence itself, both individual and corporate. 	Course as a whole, but especially final paper	MTS: 2.1, 3.2, 3.3 MDiv: 2.1, 3.2

AD Outcomes:

COURSE OUTCOMES	COURSE ELEMENT	PROGRAM OUTCOMES
By the end of this course, students	This outcome will be achieved through these course elements:	This course outcome corresponds to these aspects of Wycliffe’s statements of outcomes (MTS, MDiv)
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • will become familiar with some of the historic issues revolving around theological discussion of atonement and sacrifice, through engagement with selected classic authors and modern thinkers. <p>Indirectly, the course will also</p>	Lectures, readings	PhD: 1.1, 1.2 MA: 1.2 ThM: 1.2 DMin: 1.1, 1.2

help students to deal more readily with scriptural texts on these themes, e.g. Leviticus, Hebrews, Galatians, and other parts of the Pauline corpus. Mastery of both biblical and theological content will be demonstrated through seminar discussion and the final paper.;		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • will grapple with some of the major ecumenical issues involved in the topic of atonement and sacrifice, e.g. the question of eucharistic sacrifice; 	Course as a whole, but especially discussion, final paper	PhD: 1.1, 1.2, 2.5 MA: 1.2, 2.5 ThM: 1.2, 2.5 DMin: 1.1, 1.2, 2.3
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • will reflect theologically on atonement as a necessary element within what may be called the “cruciform life.” The practice of the church and of Christian living (e.g. the life of prayer) are constantly presupposed in this course. We will constantly be alert for the consequences of atonement theologies on Christian existence itself, both individual and corporate. 	Course as a whole, but especially final paper	PhD: 1.1, 1.2, 2.5 MA: 1.2, 2.5 ThM: 1.2, 2.5 DMin: 1.1, 1.2, 2.3

Course Resources

Required Course Texts

- A Reading Packet will be available from the Wycliffe College Front Desk

Course Website(s)

- Blackboard <https://weblogin.utoronto.ca/>

This course uses Blackboard for its course website. To access it, go to the UofT portal login page at <http://portal.utoronto.ca> and login using your UTORid and password. Once you have logged in to the portal using your UTORid and password, look for the **My Courses** module, where you’ll find the link to the website for all your Blackboard-based courses. (Your course registration with ROSI gives you access to the course website at Blackboard.) Note also the information at <http://www.portalinfo.utoronto.ca/content/information-students>. Students who have trouble accessing Blackboard should ask Thomas Power for further help.

Class Schedule

Procedure Each student will come to class prepared with a (printed) one-paragraph summary of the reading, along with one or two questions that the reading raised for you. Questions may be either of a clarificatory or a critical nature. Each week, two students will be asked to initiate the discussion by sharing and (briefly)

expanding on their questions in class. These are not presentations, but questions intended to get the conversation going.

(* denotes will be found in reading packet)

Week 1 (January 12) Introduction.

Week 2 (January 19) C.S. Lewis, *Till We Have Faces*

Frances Young, *Sacrifice and the Death of Christ*, pp. 21–46 [Part I, sections 1–2].

Week 3 (January 26) Athanasius, *The Incarnation of the Son of God*.

Week 4 (February 2) Origen, *Homilies on Leviticus*, 1–3, 9–10*

Augustine, *City of God*, Book 10.1–6, 19–20*

Supplemental: Daley 2004*.

Week 5 (February 9) Anselm of Canterbury, *Cur Deus Homo*, in *A Scholastic Miscellany*

Supplemental: Evans 1989; **Advanced:** Balthasar 1994, esp. “Soteriology: A Historical Outline”.

Week 6 (February 16) Reading Week.

Week 7 (February 23) Martin Luther, *Lectures on Galatians*, “The Argument,” plus commentary on Gal. 2:20 and 3:13*

Caroline Walker Bynum, “The Power in the Blood: Sacrifice, Satisfaction, and Substitution in Late Medieval Soteriology”

Supplemental: Peter Abelard, *Lectures on Romans*, in *A Scholastic Miscellany*; Julian of Norwich 1978.

Week 8 (March 1) Karl Barth, “The Judge Judged in Our Place,” *Church Dogmatics* 4.1*.

Week 9 (March 8) J.I. Packer, “What Did the Cross Achieve? The Logic of Penal Substitution,” in Packer and Dever, *In My Place Condemned He Stood*

William Placher, “Christ Takes Our Place: Rethinking Atonement,” *Interpretation* 53 no. 1 (Jan. 1999)*

Week 10 (March 15) Hans Boersma, *Violence, Hospitality, and the Cross* (Parts II-III; skim Part I).

Week 11 (March 22) Ephraim Radner, *Leviticus*, Introduction (skip prologue), plus commentary on Lev. 1:1–7:38, Lev. 10, Lev. 16, and Epilogue *

Week 12 (March 29) George Hunsinger, *The Eucharist and Ecumenism*, Part II: Eucharistic Sacrifice*

George Hunsinger, “Meditation on the Blood of Christ”*

Supplemental: Williams 1982; Jenson 1993.

Week 13 (April 5) Risto Saarinen, *God and the Gift: An Ecumenical Theology of Giving*.

Evaluation

Requirements

List the methods by which student performance shall be evaluated. This should include whether the methods of evaluation will be essays, tests, class participation, seminar presentations, examinations, or other; the relative weight of these methods in relation to the overall grade; and the timing of each major evaluation.

In graduate courses, there is no requirement for multiple assessments. However, if any one essay, test examination etc. has a value of more than 80% of the grade, this must be made clear in the information described in B.1.1 above. If participation forms part of the final grade it must not constitute more than 20%.

Grading System

Letter Grade	Numerical Equivalents	Grade Point	Grasp of Subject Matter
A+	90–100%	4.0	Profound & Creative
A	85–89%	4.0	Outstanding
A-	80–84%	3.7	Excellent
B+	77–79%	3.3	Very Good
B	73–76%	3.0	Good
B-	70–72%	2.7	Satisfactory
FZ	0–69%	0	Failure

Grades without numerical equivalent:

CR	Designates credit; has no numerical equivalent or grade point value
NCR	Designates failure; has no numerical equivalent, but has a grade point value of 0 and is included in the GPA calculation
SDF	Standing deferred (a temporary extension)
INC	Permanent incomplete; has no numerical equivalent or grade point value
WDR	Withdrawal without academic penalty
AEG	May be given to a final year student who, because of illness, has completed at least 60% of the course, but not the whole course, and who would not otherwise be able to convocate; has no numerical equivalent and no grade point value

Policy on Assignment Extensions

Basic Degree students are expected to complete all course work by the end of the term in which they are registered. Under **exceptional circumstances**, with the written permission of the instructor, students may request an extension (SDF = “standing deferred”) beyond the term. An extension, when offered, will have a mutually agreed upon deadline that does not extend beyond the conclusion of the following term. An SDF must be requested no later than the last day of classes of the term in which the course is taken. The request form is available on the college website or from the Registrar’s office.

One percentage point per day will be deducted on the course grade if an extension has not been requested by the stated deadline.

Course grades. Consistently with the policy of the University of Toronto, course grades submitted by an instructor are reviewed by a committee of the instructor's college before being posted. Course grades may be adjusted where they do not comply with University grading policy (<http://www.governingcouncil.utoronto.ca/Assets/Governing+Council+Digital+Assets/Policies/PDF/grading.pdf>) or college grading policy.

Policies

Accessibility. Students with a disability or health consideration are entitled to accommodation. Students must register at the University of Toronto's Accessibility Services offices; information is available at <http://www.accessibility.utoronto.ca/>. The sooner a student seeks accommodation, the quicker we can assist.

Plagiarism. Students submitting written material in courses are expected to provide full documentation for sources of both words and ideas in footnotes or endnotes. Direct quotations should be placed within quotation marks. (If small changes are made in the quotation, they should be indicated by appropriate punctuation such as brackets and ellipses, but the quotation still counts as a direct quotation.) Failure to document borrowed material constitutes plagiarism, which is a serious breach of academic, professional, and Christian ethics. An instructor who discovers evidence of student plagiarism is not permitted to deal with the situation individually but is required to report it to his or her head of college or delegate according to the TST *Basic Degree Handbook* (linked from <http://www.tst.edu/academic/resources-forms/handbooks> and the University of Toronto *Code of Behaviour on Academic Matters* (<http://www.governingcouncil.utoronto.ca/policies/behaveac.htm>), a student who plagiarizes in this course. Students will be assumed to have read the document "Avoidance of plagiarism in theological writing" published by the Graham Library of Trinity and Wycliffe Colleges (http://www.trinity.utoronto.ca/Library_Archives/Theological_Resources/Tools/Guides/plag.htm).

Other academic offences. TST students come under the jurisdiction of the University of Toronto Code of Behaviour on Academic Matters (<http://www.governingcouncil.utoronto.ca/policies/behaveac.htm>).

Writing Style. The writing standard for the Toronto School of Theology is Kate L. Turabian, *A Manual for Writers of Term Papers, Theses and Dissertations*, 7th edition (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2007), which is available at Crux Books.

Bibliography

Anderson, Gary. "Sacrifice and Sacrificial Offerings (OT)," in *Anchor Bible Dictionary* V:878.

Aulen, Gustav. *Eucharist and Sacrifice*. Edinburgh: Oliver and Boyd, 1956.

———. *Christus Victor. An Historical Study of the Three Main Types of the Idea of the Atonement*. London: SPCK, 1970 [original 1931].

Bailie, Gil. *Violence Unveiled: Humanity at the Crossroads*. New York: Crossroad, 1995.

Balthasar, Hans Urs von. *Theo-Drama: Theological Dramatic History, IV: The Action*. San Francisco: Ignatius Press, 1994.

Barth, Karl. *Church Dogmatics*, vol. 4: *The Doctrine of Reconciliation*. Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 1956.

Boersma, Hans. *Violence, Hospitality, and the Cross: Reappropriating the Atonement Tradition*. Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Academic, 2004.

- Bynum, Caroline Walker. "The Power in the Blood: Sacrifice, Satisfaction, and Substitution in Late Medieval Soteriology." In *The Redemption*, ed. Stephen T. Davis et al. Oxford: OUP, 2004.
- Daley, Brian, SJ. "'He Himself is Our Peace' (Eph. 2:14): Early Christian Views of Redemption in Christ." In *The Redemption*, ed. Stephen T. Davis et al. Oxford: OUP, 2004.
- Daly, Robert J. *Sacrifice Unveiled: the True Meaning of Christian Sacrifice*. London: T & T Clark, 2011.
- Dillistone, F.W. *The Christian Understanding of Atonement*. London: James Nisbet & Co., 1968.
- Dulles, SJ, Avery. "The Eucharist as Sacrifice." In *Rediscovering the Eucharist: Ecumenical Conversations*. Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press, 2003: 175–87.
- Evans, G.R. *Saint Anselm of Canterbury*. London: Continuum, 1989.
- Fee, Gordon D. "Paul and the Metaphors for Salvation: some Reflections on Pauline Soteriology." In *The Redemption*, ed. Stephen T. Davis et al. Oxford: OUP, 2004.
- Forsyth, P.T. *The Cruciality of the Cross*. London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1909.
- . *The Work of Christ*. London: Independent Press, 1910.
- Gerald O'Collins and M.K. Jones. *Jesus Our Priest: A Christian Approach to the Priesthood of Christ*. Oxford: OUP, 2010.
- Heim, S. Mark. *Saved from Sacrifice: A Theology of the Cross*. Grand Rapids, MI: William B. Eerdmans Pub. Co., 2006.
- Hengel, Martin. *The Atonement: A Study of the Origins of the Doctrine in the New Testament*. London: SCM Press, 1981.
- Hunsinger, George. *The Eucharist and Ecumenism: Let Us Keep the Feast*. Cambridge: CUP, 2008.
- Jenson, Robert W. *Systematic Theology*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1997, 1999.
- . *Unbaptized God: The Basic Flaw in Ecumenical Theology*. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1993.
- Julian of Norwich. *Showings* (Classics of Western Spirituality). Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press, 1978.
- Kilmartin, Edward J. *The Eucharist in the West: History and Theology*. Collegeville, MN: Liturgical Press, 1998.
- Levenson, Jon. *The Death and Resurrection of the Beloved Son*. New Haven: Yale Univ. Press, 1993.
- Levering, Matthew. *Christ's Fulfillment of Torah and Temple: Salvation According to Thomas Aquinas*. Notre Dame: Notre Dame Univ. Press, 2002.
- Levering, Matthew. *Sacrifice and Community: Jewish Offering and Christian Eucharist*. Malden, MA: T & T Clark, 2011.
- Lindbeck, George. "Atonement and the Hermeneutics of Social Embodiment." *Pro Ecclesia*, Spring 1996.
- Milbank, John. *Being Reconciled: Ontology and Pardon*. London: Routledge, 2003.
- Moffitt, David M. *Atonement and the Logic of Resurrection in the Epistle to the Hebrews*. Boston: Brill, 2011.
- O'Collins, Gerald, S.J. *Jesus Our Priest: A Christian Approach to the Priesthood of Christ*. Oxford: OUP, 2010.

- Origen. *Homilies on Leviticus* (The Fathers of the Church: A New Translation). Washington: Catholic University of America Press, 1990.
- Packer, J.I., and Mark Dever. *In My Place Condemned He Stood: Celebrating the Glory of the Atonement*. Wheaton, IL: Crossway Books, 2007.
- Pelikan, Jaroslav. *The Growth of Medieval Theology (600-1300)*, vol. 3 in *The Christian Tradition: A History of the Development of Doctrine*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1978.
- Placher, William. "Christ Takes Our Place: Rethinking Atonement," *Interpretation* 53 no. 1 (Jan. 1999).
- Radner, Ephraim. *Leviticus*. Brazos Theological Commentary Series. Grand Rapids: Brazos, 2008.
- Rahner, Karl. "Sacrificial Theology and The Eucharist." *One in Christ* 17, no. 4 (1981).
- Root, Michael. "Dying He Lives: Biblical Image, Biblical Narrative, and the Redemptive Jesus," in *Semeia* 30 (1984)
- Saarinen, Risto. *God and the Gift: An Ecumenical Theology of Giving*. Collegeville, MN: Liturgical Press, 2005.
- Sacrifice in the Bible*, ed. Roger Beckwith and Martin J. Selman. Paternoster, 1995.
- Schwager, Raymond. *Jesus in the Drama of Salvation: Toward a Biblical Doctrine of Redemption*. New York: Herder and Herder, 1999.
- Sherman, Robert. *King, Priest, and Prophet: A Trinitarian Theology of Atonement*. New York: T&T Clark/Continuum, 2004.
- Sykes, Stephen, ed. *Sacrifice and Redemption: Durham Essays in Theology*. Cambridge: CUP, 1991.
- . *Sacrifice and Redemption* (Durham Essays in Theology). Cambridge: CUP, 1990.
- Tanner, Kathryn. "Incarnation, Cross, and Sacrifice: A Feminist-Inspired Reappraisal," *Anglican Theological Review* 86 (2004): 35–6.
- The Atonement Debate: Papers from the London Symposium on the Theology of Atonement*. Ed. Derek Tidball et al. Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 2008.
- Weaver, J. Denny. *The Non-Violent Atonement*. Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2001.
- Williams, Rowan. *Eucharistic Sacrifice: The Roots of a Metaphor*. Bramcote, UK: Grove Books, 1982.
- World Council of Church. Baptism, Eucharist, and Ministry*. Geneva: World Council of Churches, 1982.
- Young, Frances M. *The Use of Sacrificial Ideas in Greek Christian Writers from the New Testament to John Chrysostom*. Philadelphia: The Philadelphia Patristic Foundation, 1975.
- . *Sacrifice and the Death of Christ*. London: SCM Press, 1975.