



Course Syllabus Wycliffe College Toronto School of Theology

Course Identification

Course Number : WYB 5032 H
Course Name: Early Christian Self-definition

Instructor Information

Instructor: Terry Donaldson
E-mail: tdonaldson@wycliffe.utoronto.ca or terry.donaldson@utoronto.ca
Office Hours: By arrangement

Course Prerequisites or Requisites

While there are no specific language requirements, students are expected to make use of any ancient or modern languages that they have studied (for which they have received TST recognition), when appropriate and at the level of recognition (competence, proficiency, expertise).

Course Description

A study of the developing self-understanding of early Christianity, seen in the context of the process by which the Christ movement separated from its Jewish matrix and developed into a distinct, largely Gentile religion. The major portion of the course will consist of a study of selected Christian literature with attention to specific issues of self-definition.

Course Methodology

Class time will be used in three different ways:

- (1) Lectures: For at least part of each class in the first half of the course, I will provide a framework for the course in a series of lectures. The outline for the lectures is given below.
- (2) Readings (primary and secondary): Also in the first part of the course, we will spend five hour-long sessions in discussion arising from assigned readings in Justin's *Dialogue with Trypho the Jew*, together with selected secondary sources. Prior to the class in which the readings are to be discussed (specifically, by noon on the Wednesday prior to the Thursday class), students are to post one observation or question arising from the readings on the Discussion Board of the course website. These postings should relate to some aspect of the four course questions described below (see the section on "Seminar paper" under "Requirements") and should arise from some intersection of or interaction between the two readings. Each posting should be focused (dealing with one main point or issue), concise (a paragraph or two) and substantive (i.e., bearing on the central concerns of the course in some potentially significant way). Students should read the postings of other members in the class, but are not required to post a response. The postings will provide us with a point of departure for further discussion in class.

(3) Seminar presentations: Most of the classes after reading week will be devoted to a study of selected pieces of the New Testament and other early Christian literature. The selection of literature will depend to some extent on the particular interests of those in the class. The basis of our study will be short papers prepared by members of the class. These papers will not be delivered orally; instead, they will be posted on the course website ahead of time (see further below), read by the other members of the class and then discussed in class. Prior to each class, all other students will be required to read the paper or papers for the week and to post a response. As with the readings from Justin (above), the responses should be focused, concise and of a kind that will foster discussion. The responses are to be posted on the Discussion Board by 9:00 p.m. on the Tuesday prior to Thursday's class.

Writings chosen for seminar presentations in the past have included: Matthew; Luke-Acts (or either one); John; an epistle of Paul; Revelation; *Epistle of Barnabas*; *Didache*; Ignatius; Marcion; Melito's *Peri Pascha*; Tertullian's *Against the Jews*. It is hoped that at least one extra-canonical writing will be included.

The **lectures** will follow this outline:

1. Introduction
2. Separation from Judaism
 - 2.1 Factors affecting current context
 - 2.11 *Holocaust and Christian anti-Judaism*
 - 2.22 *New conceptions of Second Temple Judaism*
 - 2.23 *New conceptions of Christian origins*
 - 2.2 The situation at 30 and 150 CE
 - 2.21 *Earliest Jewish Christianity: social placement and self-understanding*
 - 2.22 *Justin Martyr: social placement and self-understanding*
 - 2.3 The process of separation:
 - 2.31 *Stages*
 - 2.32 *Factors*
 - 2.4 Christian self-definition vis-à-vis Judaism
3. Gentilization
 - 3.1 Jewish “patterns of universalism”
 - 3.2 Early Christian patterns of Gentile inclusion
 - 3.3 The process of Gentilization
 - 3.4 “Gentiles”
 - 3.5 The landscape in the middle of the 2nd c.
 - 3.6 Christian self-definition vis-à-vis the Roman empire

Course Outcomes

The first column below contains the set of intended learning outcomes for the course; these describe the level of knowledge and skill that will be characteristic of a typical student who completes the course successfully. These outcomes will provide one of the benchmarks for evaluation and grading and for program assessment. The third column links each course learning outcome to one or more of the “degree level expectations” that are described in more detail in the respective program Handbooks. Doctoral students are typically required to demonstrate higher levels of ability or expertise.

COURSE OUTCOMES	COURSE ELEMENT	PROGRAM OUTCOMES
By the end of this course, students	This outcome will be demonstrated through these course elements:	This course outcome corresponds to these aspects of the Degree Learning Expectations (DLEs) for the graduate programs:
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • will be able to describe the emergence of the early Christian movement within the Jewish world and its development into various Jewish and Gentile groups (more or less) distinct from Judaism 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • online and class discussion • final paper 	1. Depth and breadth of knowledge
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • will be able to describe the various ways in which this process of development has been understood and conceptualized 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • online and class discussion • final paper 	1. Depth and breadth of knowledge 2. Research and scholarship 6. Awareness of the limits of knowledge
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • will be able to recognize and analyze pertinent aspects of Christian self-definition vis-à-vis both the Jewish and the Roman worlds 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • online and class discussion • seminar presentation • final paper 	2. Research and scholarship 6. Awareness of the limits of knowledge
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • will be able to discern the distinct features of one piece of early Christian literature as seen in the context of this process of separation and self-definition 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • seminar presentation • final paper 	2. Research and scholarship 3. Level of application of knowledge 6. Awareness of the limits of knowledge
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • will have demonstrated the following scholarly skills: 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • seminar presentation • final paper 	2. Research and scholarship 3. Level of application of knowledge

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • clear and effective communication in both oral and written forms • the ability to construct and carry out a scholarly research project • facility with appropriate bibliographic, methodological and linguistic tools and resources • the use of standard conventions of style for scholarly writing 		<p>5. Level of communication skills</p> <p>6. Awareness of the limits of knowledge</p>
---	--	--

Course Resources

Required Course Texts

An English version of Justin Martyr’s *Dialogue with Trypho*. The preferred edition is Thomas B. Falls and Thomas P. Halton (trans. & ed.), *St. Justin Martyr: Dialogue with Trypho* (Washington DC: Catholic University of America Press, 2003), available through Amazon.ca. If you don’t want to buy your own copy, there are also a number of other copies in the library system, as well as an earlier translation by Thomas B. Falls (*Saint Justin Martyr: The First Apology; The Second Apology; Dialogue with Trypho; Exhortation to the Greeks; Discourse to the Greeks; The Monarchy, or, The Rule of God* [Washington: Catholic University of America Press, 1965]). Both books are on reserve in the Graham Library. An electronic version of the old translation in the *Ante-Nicene Fathers* is available online (Christian Classics Ethereal Library [www. ccel.org](http://www.ccel.org)). I would like you to bring to class either a copy of the book or a photocopy of the readings for each week.

Course Website(s)

Quercus: <https://q.utoronto.ca/>

This course uses Quercus for its course website. To access it, go to the U of T Quercus login page at <https://q.utoronto.ca/> and login using your UTORid and password. Once you have logged in to Quercus using your UTORid and password, look for the My Courses module, where you’ll find the link to the website for all your Quercus-based courses. (Your course registration with ACORN gives you access to the course website in Quercus.) Information for students about using Quercus can be found at: <https://community.canvaslms.com/docs/DOC-10701> .

Writing Style

The writing standard for the Toronto School of Theology is Kate L. Turabian, *A Manual for Writers of Term Papers, Theses and Dissertations*, 9th edition (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2018).

Bibliography

A bibliography will be available on the course website.

Class Schedule

A tentative outline of **classes** is as follows:

- Week 1 Introduction to course
Lecture
- Week 2 Discussion of readings:
- Justin *Dialogue* 1-10
 - Terence L. Donaldson, “Eusebius, Aristides and Paul: Gentile Christianity, the Parting of the Ways, and Roman Imperial Ideology about the Nations” (file available on the course website).
- Lecture
- Week 3 Discussion of readings
- Justin *Dialogue* 11-30
 - Richard Bauckham, “James and the Jerusalem Community,” in Oskar Skarsaune and Reidar Hvalvik, ed. *Jewish Believers in Jesus: The Early Centuries* (Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 2007), pp. 55-81. (file available on course website; note that you do not need to read pp. 81-95)
- Lecture
- Week 4 Discussion of readings
- Justin *Dialogue* 31-47
 - James Parkes, *The Conflict of the Church and the Synagogue: A Study in the Origins of Antisemitism* (New York: Hermon Press, 1974 [1934]), pp. 77-106 (file available on course website; also available online through the library)
 - Adele Reinhartz, “A Fork in the Road or a Multi-Lane Highway? New Perspectives on the ‘Parting of the Ways’ between Judaism and Christianity,” in *The Changing Face of Judaism, Christianity, and Other Greco-Roman Religions in Antiquity*, ed. Ian H. Henderson and Gerbern S. Oegema (Gütersloh: Gütersloh Verlagshaus, 2006), pp. 280-293. (file available on course website)
- Lecture
- Week 5 Discussion of readings
- Justin *Dialogue* 110-125
 - Terence L. Donaldson, “Supersessionism and Early Christian Self-definition.” *Journal of the Jesus Movement in its Jewish Setting* 3 (2016), 1-32 (journal available online through the library). **See also** the file “Typology” on the course website, a revised version of the typology developed in the *JJMJS* article.
- Lecture
- Week 6 Discussion of readings
- Justin *Dialogue* 130-142

- Judith Lieu. “Introduction: The Emergence of Christian Identity,” chapter 1 (pp. 1-26) of *Christian Identity in the Jewish and Graeco-Roman World*. (Oxford; New York: Oxford University Press, 2004). (online version of the book available through the library)

Lecture

Weeks 7-11 Student seminar presentations and discussion

Week 12 Wrap-up

Evaluation

Requirements

The final mark for the course will be based on evaluations in four areas:

- (1) Preparation, presence and participation (20%) – The weekly postings (observations on readings, questions on student papers) are included in the participation component. (See above, under “Procedures and Outline.”)
- (2) Seminar paper (30%) – For each selected piece of early Christian literature we will be asking four questions (or, better, four sets of questions). These questions will be developed in the lectures, but they can be described here in brief; the first three are literary and theological, while the fourth is historical and sociological:
 1. *The ekklesia and scriptural Israel*: the nature and character of scriptural Israel; the place and purpose of Israel in the process of salvation that is accomplished through Christ; the way in which Israel’s scriptures are claimed as a Christian book (the “Old Testament”); the presumed relationship between scriptural Israel and the *ekklēsia*.
 2. *Jews, Gentiles and the ekklesia*: the theological framework within which membership of non-Jews (“Gentiles”) in the *ekklēsia* is understood; the *ekklēsia* and the nations (*ethnē*); the status of Jewish Christ-believers; the relationship between Jewish and Gentile Christ-believers.
 3. *Continuing Judaism*: attitude towards Jews and Judaism; the nature and purpose of anti-Judaic polemic; theological status of Judaism in the present and in the eschatological future.
 4. *Socio-historical location*: location of the author and his intended readers with respect to Judaism and the wider Roman world; placement within the process of separation.

Each student is to select one piece of literature and to write a short paper (8 - 10 pages / 2400 - 3000 words) dealing with the selected piece from the perspective of one (or more) of these four sets of questions. While the paper may function as part of the preparation for the final seminar paper (below), the primary purpose of the paper is to introduce the selected piece of literature to the other members of the seminar, to draw attention to aspects of the piece that have a bearing on one (or more) of the four sets of questions, and to identify questions for further investigation. The paper should also contain a substantial bibliography of secondary sources dealing with the selected piece of literature from the perspective of the questions being discussed in the course. (The bibliography will be in addition to the page / word total indicated above.) The paper (with bibliography) is to be submitted to the instructor in electronic form by 5:00 p.m. on the Friday before the class in which it will be discussed. It will then be posted on the course website (by Saturday evening at the latest). A sign-up sheet will be distributed the second week of class.

(3) Final paper (proposal: 10%; paper: 40%) – The final requirement is a scholarly paper (20–25 pages / 6,000–7,500 words) on a topic to be chosen by the student and confirmed with the professor. Normally the paper will deal with the same piece of early Christian literature that was the subject of the seminar paper, and will build on the work done for that paper. Nevertheless, in contrast to the seminar paper (which is to function more in an introductory, descriptive and question-raising way), the final paper should be a research paper (research question, deliberate attention to methodology, well-constructed argument in support of a thesis). A paper proposal (including a working bibliography) is to be submitted by Friday Nov. 22. The paper is due by the end of examination week (i.e., Friday Dec. 13). The date beyond which a student would need to arrange for an SDF (with his or her college Graduate Director) is [TBA].

Grading System - Graduate Degree Students

5000, 6000 and 7000 level courses use the following alpha grading scale;

A+	(90-100)	Profound & creative
A	(85-89)	Outstanding
A-	(80-84)	Excellent
B+	(77-79)	Very Good
B	(73-76)	Good
B-	(70-72)	Satisfactory at a post-baccalaureate level
FZ	(0-69)	Failure

Please see the appropriate handbook for more details about the grading scale and non-numerical grades (e.g. SDF, INC, etc).

Late work. The prima facie deadline for the completion of work in a course is the last day of the examination week for the trimester in which the course is taken. Students are expected to meet the course deadlines of the instructor offering the course and are advised to plan their research projects accordingly. Students who find themselves unable to meet deadlines for completing coursework can, under certain conditions, receive extensions for completing the work after the dates set by the college in which the course is offered.

The authority to grant an extension for the completion of work in a course beyond the original TST or college deadline (whichever is earlier) for that course rests with the student's college Graduate Director, not the instructor of the course. Nevertheless, the instructor's signature is required for course extension requests to be processed. Students will petition their college Graduate Director for extensions, using a standard form provided by TST on its website. See Section 7.11 of the Conjoint Graduate Degree Handbook.

Course grades. Consistently with the policy of the University of Toronto, course grades submitted by an instructor are reviewed by a committee of the instructor's college before being posted to ACORN. Grades are not official until they are posted to ACORN. Course grades may be adjusted where they do not comply with University Assessment and Grading Practices Policy found at www.governingcouncil.utoronto.ca/Assets/Governing+Council+Digital+Assets/Policies/PDF/grading.pdf, policies found in the TST conjoint program handbooks, or college grading policy.

Policies

Accessibility. Students with a disability or health consideration, whether temporary or permanent, are entitled to accommodation. Students in conjoint degree programs must register at the University of Toronto's Accessibility Services offices; information is available at <http://www.accessibility.utoronto.ca/>. The sooner a student seeks accommodation, the quicker we can assist.

Plagiarism. Students submitting written material in courses are expected to provide full documentation for sources of both words and ideas in footnotes or endnotes. Direct quotations should be placed within quotation marks. (If small changes are made in the quotation, they should be indicated by appropriate punctuation such as brackets and ellipses, but the quotation still counts as a direct quotation.) Failure to document borrowed material constitutes plagiarism, which is a serious breach of academic, professional, and Christian ethics. An instructor who discovers evidence of student plagiarism is not permitted to deal with the situation individually but is required to report it to his or her head of college or delegate according to the TST *Basic Degree Handbook* and the Graduate program Handbooks (linked from <http://www.tst.edu/academic/resources-forms/handbooks> and the University of Toronto *Code of Behaviour on Academic Matters* <http://www.governingcouncil.utoronto.ca/AssetFactory.aspx?did=4871>). A student who plagiarizes in this course will be assumed to have read the document "Avoidance of plagiarism in theological writing" published by the Graham Library of Trinity and Wycliffe Colleges http://www.trinity.utoronto.ca/Library_Archives/Theological_Resources/Tools/Guides/plag.htm.

Other academic offences. TST students come under the jurisdiction of the University of Toronto *Code of Behaviour on Academic Matters* <http://www.governingcouncil.utoronto.ca/policies/behaveac.htm>.

Back-up copies. Please make back-up copies of essays before handing them in.

Obligation to check email. At times, the course instructor may decide to send out important course information by email. To that end, all students in conjoint programs are required to have a valid utoronto email address. Students must have set up their utoronto email address which is entered in the ACORN system. Information is available at www.utorid.utoronto.ca. The course instructor will not be able to help you with this. 416-978-HELP and the Help Desk at the Information Commons can answer questions you may have about your UTORid and password. *Students should check utoronto email regularly* for messages about the course. **Forwarding** your utoronto.ca email to a Hotmail, Gmail, Yahoo or other type of email account is not advisable. In some cases, messages from utoronto.ca addresses sent to Hotmail, Gmail or Yahoo accounts are filtered as junk mail, which means that emails from your course instructor may end up in your spam or junk mail folder. Students in non-conjoint programs should contact the Registrar of their college of registration.

Email communication with the course instructor. The instructor aims to respond to email communications from students in a timely manner. *All email communications from students in conjoint programs must be sent from a utoronto email address.* Email communications from other email addresses are not secure, and also the instructor cannot readily identify them as being legitimate emails from students. The instructor is not obliged to respond to email from non-utoronto addresses for students in conjoint programs. Students in non-conjoint programs should only use the email address they have provided to their college of registration.