Title: The Unity of the Church: Theologies of Ecclesial Oneness WYT5412H

Instructor: Ephraim Radner, Wycliffe College; Mark Elliot, Wycliffe College/Univ. of Glasgow

Description:

This course will examine how Christians and Christian traditions have understood and justified the first "mark of the Church", her unity. This will include an examination of the historical constraints on such understandings. Key writings from the early Church, Eastern Orthodoxy, Western traditions (Catholic and Protestant), and ecumenical authors will be read. In addition, some political and philosophical discussions of the nature of consent and consensus will be covered.

Given that this is an intensive course, not all readings assigned for each day are required for that day; rather, the readings listed for days 2-6 will be divided among students for presentation purposes. Some of the day's readings, furthermore, will be optional (this will be determined based on the number of enrolled students and presentations).

The class meetings will consist of faculty orientation to the readings, brief student presentations of assigned readings, discussion.

Following the completion of class meetings, reading summaries of all assigned readings (3 pages total per day's readings), and a 15-20 page paper will be due by July 30th.

Evaluation based on presentations and subsequent reading summaries (30%), participation (30%), Final paper (40%).

Schedule

Classes will meet 8 times, 9 AM to 12 AM, with an additional requirement of attending the Wycliffe Scripture and Theology Colloquium on Thursday, May 9th, on the topic of "The Identity of Israel" (see Day 5 below).

Monday April 29th Tuesday April 30 Thursday May 2 Friday May 3

Monday May 6
Tuesday, May 7
Wednesday, May 8
[Thursday, May 9 – Colloquium – 9 AM-3:30 pm; lunch included]

Friday, May 10

Readings

There are several required texts for purchase, available at the Law School Bookstore (basement), across the street from Wycliffe

Other than required texts, all other assigned reading will be available online, either as pdf's, U of T online books, or other online material.

Required For Purchase (see below for full reference)

Nicholas of Cusa, The Catholic Concordance

Louthan/Zachman, Conciliation and Confession

Stuart Hampshire, Justice is Conflict

Michael Kinnamon, The Ecumenical Movement

Ephraim Radner, Church

Bibliography [in order of reading]:

Giuseppe Ruggieri and Miklos Tomka, *The Church in Fragments: Towards What Kind of Unity?* (Maryknoll: Orbis, 1997) [pdf]

Ephraim Radner, *A Brutal Unity: The Spiritual Politics of the Christian Church* (Waco: Baylor University Press, 2012).

Lorelei F. Fuchs, *Koinonia and the Quest for an Ecumenical Ecclesiology* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2008) – c. 1; Appendix 1. [pdf]

Lionel Thornton, "The Body of Christ in the New Testament", in K. Kirk, ed. *The Apostolic Ministry* (1946), (60 pp.) [pdf]

Gosnell Yorke, *The Church as the Body of Christ in the Pauline Corpus: A Re-Examination* (Lanham: Univ. Press of America, 1991), cc. 1, 2, 7 (30 pp), [pdf]

Cyprian – On the Unity of the Church – online at ccel.org

Augustine, Tractates on John, 104-111 (on John 17) – online at ccel.org

Andrew Louth, "Unity and Diversity in the Church of the Fourth Century", in R. N.

Swanson (ed.), *Unity and Diversity in the Church* (Oxford: Blackwell), 1996), pp. 1-17 [pdf]

Gary Macy, "Was there a 'The Church' in the Middle Ages?", in Swanson, pp. 107-116 [pdf]

Nicholas of Cusa – *The Catholic Concordance (De Concordantia)*, ed. Paul Sigmund (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1991) – Intro (30 pp.), Books I and II (200 pp.) and Book III – pp. 237-267, 313-322.

Howard P. Louthan (Editor), Randall C. Zachman, *Conciliation And Confession: The Struggle For Unity In The Age Of Reform, 1415-1648* (Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press, 2004), cc. 1-7, and 11 (210 pp.)

Ola Tjørhom, 'Early Modern Lutheran Ecclesiology' in U. Lehner-R. Muller (eds.), *The Oxford Handbook of Early Modern Theology*, *1600-1800* (OUP, 2016) [online UoT]

G., Plasger, "Ecclesiology" in *The Calvin Handbook*, edited by H.J. Selderhuis, translated by R.H. Lundell (Grand Rapids, Eerdmans Publishing Company, 2009), 323-331 [pdf]

Benjamin Kaplan, *Divided By Faith*: *Religious Conflict and the Practice of Toleration in Early Modern Europe* (Harvard, 2007); cc. 8, 10, 12 [pdf]

Lim, Paul, "The Trinity, *Adiaphora*, Ecclesiology, and Reformation: John Owen's Theory of Religious Toleration in Context", in *The Westminster Theological Quarterly* 67 (2005), pp. 281-300 – [pdf].

Radner, "The Holy Spirit and Unity: Getting Out of the Way of Christ", *International Journal of Systematic Theology*, 16 no 2 Apr 2014, p 207-220 [pdf]

Alexei Khomiakov, *The Church Is One*, and related texts, in *On Spiritual Unity: A Slavophile Reader (Library of Russian Philosophy.)*, eds. Boris Jakim and Robert Bird, (New York: Lindisfarne Books, 1998) [pdf]

Dennis M. Doyle, 'Möhler, Schleiermacher and the Roots of Communion Ecclesiology', *Theological Studies* 57 (1996): 467-80 [pdf]

James Dunn, "Fundamental Consensus in the New Testament", in Joseph Burgess (ed.), *In Search of Christian Unity* (Minneapolis: Fortress, 1991), pp. 200-221.

Klaus Nürnberger, "Can Unity be Based on Consensus? The Gospel of God's Unconditional Suffering, Redeeming Acceptance of the Unacceptable as the Foundation of Christian Unity", in *Journal of Theology for South Africa* 116 (Jul. 2003), pp. 9-25 -- [pdf]

Stuart Hampshire, Justice is Conflict (Princeton: Princeton Univ. Press, 2000)

P. H. Partridge, *Consent and Consensus* (London: Pall Mall, 1971), cc. 1-5 – [pdf] (100 pp.)

Henri de Lubac. *The Splendour of the Church* (translated [from the French] by Michael Mason, (Glen Rock, N.J.: Paulist Press, 1963/San Francisco: Ignatius, 1999); cc. 1-3 [pdf]

Dennis Doyle, "Journet, Congar, and the Root of Communion Ecclesiology", *Theological Studies*, 58:3 (Setp. 1997), pp. 461-479 [pdf]

Jon Sobrino and Juan Hernandez Pico, *Theology of Christian Solidarity* (Maryknoll: Orbis, 1985)

John Paul II -- *Ut Unim Sint* -- online at www.vatican.va

Michael Kinnamon and Brian Cope (eds.), *The Ecumenical Movement: An Anthology of Key Texts and Voices* (WCC/Eerdmans, 1997), Sections One and Two: "The Ecumenical Vision" and "The Unity of the Church" (pp. 9-129)

John Webster, 'On Evangelical Ecclesiology', in *Confessing God: Essays in Christian Dogmatics II* (T&T Clark, 2005), 153-93.

George Lindbeck, "The Church" and "Confession and Community", in George Lindbeck, *The Church in a Postliberal Age* (London: SCM, 2002), pp. 145-65; 1-9 [pdf]

Lindbeck, "Post-modern hermeneutics and Jewish- Christian dialogue", and "What of the future?", in Tikva Frymer-Kensky et al, *Christianity in Jewish Terms* (Boulder, CO: Westview, 2000), pp. 106-113; 157-66. [pdf].

Mark Kinzer: *Postmissionary Messianic Judaism: Redefining Christian Engagement with the Jewish People* (Grand Rapids: Brazos, 2005), cc. 4,9) "Bilateral Ecclesiology", "Healing the Schism") [pdf]

Kinzer, Searching HerOwn Mystery: Nostra Aetate, The Jewish People, and the Identity of the Church (Eugene, OR: Cascade, 2013) c. 9 ("The Task of Mutual Indwelling") [pdf]

Avi Sagi, *The Open Canon: On the Meaning of Halakhic Discourse*, (London/New York: Continuum, 2007), cc. 1, 11,12 [pdf]

Ephraim Radner, *Church* (Eugene, OR: Cascade, 2017).

Outcomes (acc. to TST Doctoral Handbook, Appendix 2)

- 2.3: use and competence in library/bibliographic work
- 2.4: use and competence in web-based resources

- 2.5: honing of written and oral communication scholarly skills
- 3.1: basic familiarity with topic of ecclesial unity in relation to ecclesiology and ecumenism, methods of research, and inter-disciplinary elements for understanding
- 4.3.1.2: deepened understanding of the ecumenical character of theological research itself

Schedule:

Day 1. The challenge

Giuseppe Ruggieri and Miklos Tomka, *The Church in Fragments: Towards What Kind of Unity?* (Maryknoll: Orbis, 1997) [pdf]

Ephraim Radner, *Brutal Unity*.ch. 2 (Division is Murder) [pdf]

Lorelei f. Fuchs, *Koinonia and the Quest for an Ecumenical Ecclesiology* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2008) – c. 1; Appendix 1.[pdf]

Lionel Thornton, "The Body of Christ in the New Testament", in K. Kirk, ed. *The Apostolic Ministry* (1946), (60 pp.) [pdf]

Gosnell Yorke, *The Church as the body of Christ in the Pauline Corpus: A Re-Examination* (Lanham: Univ. Press of America, 1991), cc. 1, 2, 7 (30 pp), [pdf]

2. The early church

Cyprian – On the Unity of the Church – online at ccel.org

Augustine, Tractates on John, 104-111 (on John 17) – online at ccel.org

Andrew Louth, "Unity and Diversity in the Church of the Fourth Century", in R. N. Swanson (ed.), *Unity and Diversity in the Church* (Oxford: Blackwell), 1996), pp. 1-17, pdf

3. Middle Ages and Reformation

Gary Macy, "Was there a 'The Church' in the Middle Ages?", in Swanson, pp. 107-116 [pdf]

Nicholas of Cusa – *The Catholic Concordance (De Concordantia)*, ed. Paul Sigmund (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1991) – Intro (30 pp.), Books I and II (200 pp.) and Book III – pp. 237-267, 313-322.

Ola Tjørhom, 'Early Modern Lutheran Ecclesiology' in U. Lehner-R. Muller (eds.), *The Oxford Handbook of Early Modern Theology*, *1600-1800* (OUP, 2016) [online UoT]

G., Plasger, "Ecclesiology" in *The Calvin Handbook*, edited by H.J. Selderhuis, translated by R.H. Lundell (Grand Rapids, Eerdmans Publishing Company, 2009), 323-331 [pdf]

Howard P. Louthan (Editor), Randall C. Zachman, Conciliation And Confession: The

Struggle For Unity In The Age Of Reform, 1415-1648 (Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press, 2004), cc. 1-7, and 11 (210 pp.)

Benjamin Kaplan, *Divided By Faith: Religious Conflict and the Practice of Toleration in Early Modern Europe* (Harvard, 2007); cc. 8, 10, 12 [pdf]

Lim, Paul, he Trinity, *Adiaphora*, Ecclesiology, and Reformation: John Owen's Theory of Religious Toleration in Context", in *The Westminster Theological Quarterly* 67 (2005), pp. 281-300 – [pdf]

Radner, "The Holy Spirit and Unity: Getting Out of the Way of Christ", *International Journal of Systematic Theology*, 16 no 2 Apr 2014, p 207-220 [pdf]

4. Modern concepts of unity (1)

Alexei Khomiakov, *The Church Is One*, and related texts, in *On Spiritual Unity: A Slavophile Reader (Library of Russian Philosophy.)*, eds. Boris Jakim and Robert Bird, (New York: Lindisfarne Books, 1998) [pdf]

Dennis M. Doyle, 'Möhler, Schleiermacher and the Roots of Communion Ecclesiology', *Theological Studies* 57 (1996): 467-80 [pdf]

James Dunn, "Fundamental Consensus in the New Testament", in Joseph Burgess (ed.), *In Search of Christian Unity* (Minneapolis: Fortress, 1991), pp. 200-221 [pdf]

Klaus Nürnberger, "Can Unity Be Based on Consensus? The Gospel of God's Unconditional Suffering, Redeeming Acceptance of the Unacceptable as the Foundation of Christian Unity", in *Journal of Theology for South Africa* 116 (Jul. 2003), pp. 9-25 – [pdf]

Stuart Hampshire, *Justice is Conflict* (Princeton: Princeton Univ. Press, 2000)

Ephraim Radner, *Brutal Unity: The Spiritual Political of the Christian Church* (Waco, TX: Baylor University Press, 2012), cc. 5, 6 [pdf]

5. Modern Concepts of Unity (2)

Henri de Lubac. *The Splendour of the Church* (translated [from the French] by Michael Mason, (Glen Rock, N.J.: Paulist Press, 1963/San Francisco: Ignatius, 1999); cc. 1-3 [pdf]

Dennis Doyle, "Journet, Congar, and the Root of Communion Ecclesiology", *Theological Studies*, 58:3 (Setp. 1997), pp. 461-479 [pdf]

Jon Sobrino and Juan Hernandez Pico, *Theology of Christian Solidarity* (Maryknoll:

Orbis, 1985) [pdf]

John Paul II -- Ut Unum Sint -- online at www.vatican.va

Michael Kinnamon and Brian Cope (eds.), *The Ecumenical Movement: An Anthology of Key Texts and Voices* (WCC/Eerdmans, 1997), Sections One and Two: "The Ecumenical Vision" and "The Unity of the Church" (pp. 9-129)

John Webster, 'On Evangelical Ecclesiology', in *Confessing God: Essays in Christian Dogmatics II* (T&T Clark, 2005), 153-93.

6. A fundamental diversity? The question of Israel

George Lindbeck, "The Church" and "Confession and Community", in George Lindbeck, *The Church in a Postliberal Age* (London: SCM, 2002), pp. 145-65; 1-9 [pdf]

Lindbeck, "Post-modern hermeneutics and Jewish- Christian dialogue", and "What of the future?", in Tikva Frymer-Kensky et al, *Christianity in Jewish Terms* (Boulder, CO: Westview, 2000), pp. 106-113; 157-66. [pdf].

Mark Kinzer: *Postmissionary Messianic Judaism: Redefining Christian Engagement with the Jewish People* (Grand Rapids: Brazos, 2005), cc. 4,9) "Bilateral Ecclesiology", "Healing the Schism") [pdf]

Kinzer, Searching Her Own Mystery: Nostra Aetate, The Jewish People, and the Identity of the Church (Eugene, OR: Cascade, 2013) c. 9 ("The Task of Mutual Indwelling") [pdf]

Avi Sagi, *The Open Canon: On the Meaning of Halakhic Discourse*, (London/New York: Continuum, 2007), cc. 1, 11,12 [pdf]

7. Oneness and Ecclesiological Reflection

Ephraim Radner, *Church* (Eugene, OR: Cascade, 2017).

8. Final discussion

Accessibility

Students with a disability or health consideration are entitled to accommodation. Students must register at the University of Toronto's Accessibility Services offices; information is available at www.accessibility.utoronto.ca/. The sooner a student seeks accommodation, the quicker we can assist.

Plagiarism

Students submitting written material in courses are expected to provide full documentation for sources of both words and ideas in footnotes or endnotes. Direct quotations should be placed within quotation marks. (If small changes are made in the quotation, they should be indicated by appropriate punctuation such as brackets and ellipses, but the quotation still counts as a direct quotation.) Failure to document borrowed material constitutes plagiarism, which is a serious breach of academic, professional, and Christian ethics. An instructor who discovers evidence of student plagiarism is not permitted to deal with the situation individually but is required to report it to his or her head of college or delegate according to the TST Basic Degree Handbook (www.tst.edu/academic/resources-forms/handbooks) and the University of Toronto Code of Behaviour on Academic Matters

(<u>www.governingcouncil.utoronto.ca/policies/behaveac.htm</u>) Students will be assumed to have read the document "Avoidance of plagiarism in theological writing" published by the Graham Library of Trinity and Wycliffe

Colleges(www.trinity.utoronto.ca/Library Archives/Theological Resource s/Tools/Guides/plag.htm).

Course Website(s)

This course uses Quercus for its course website. To access it, go to the UofT Quercus login page at https://q.utoronto.ca/ and login using your UTORid and password. Once you have logged in to Quercus using your UTORid and password, look for the My Courses module, where you'll find the link to the website for all your Quercus-based courses. (Your course registration with ACORN gives you access to the course website in Quercus.) Information for students about using Quercus can be found at: https://community.canvaslms.com/docs/DOC-10701. Students who have trouble accessing Quercus should ask the assistant registrar (jhocking@wycliffe.utoronto.ca) for further help.

Style

The writing standard for the Toronto School of Theology is Kate L. Turabian, *A Manual for Writers of Term Papers, Theses and Dissertations*, 7th edition (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2007). This course does not demand strict compliance with these rules, but assumes their general frame as a guidelines.

Devices

Laptops are permitted for note-taking, notes, and e-texts only. Smart-phones and cell-phones are not permitted.

Course Evaluations

At the end of the course students are expected to complete a course evaluation. The evaluation is done online and instructions will be contained in an e-mail message that will be sent out by the Wycliffe College registrar.

Obligation to check email

At times, the course instructor may decide to send out important course information by email. To that end, all students in conjoint programs are required to have a valid utoronto email address. Students must have set up their utoronto email address which is entered in the ACORN system. Information is available at www.utorid.utoronto.ca. The course instructor will not be able to help you with this. 416-978-HELP and the Help Desk at the Information Commons can answer questions you may have about your UTORid and password. Students should check utoronto email regularly for messages about the course. Forwarding your utoronto.ca email to a Hotmail, Gmail, Yahoo or other type of email account is not advisable. In some cases, messages from utoronto.ca addresses sent to Hotmail, Gmail or Yahoo accounts are filtered as junk mail, which means that emails from your course instructor may end up in your spam or junk mail folder. Students in non-conjoint programs should contact the Registrar of their college of registration.

Email communication with the course instructor

The instructor aims to respond to email communications from students in a timely manner. All email communications from students in conjoint programs should be sent from a utoronto email address. Email communications from other email addresses are not secure, and also the instructor cannot readily identify them as being legitimate emails from students. The instructor is not obliged to respond to email from non-utoronto addresses for students in conjoint programs. Students in non-conjoint programs should only use the email address they have provided to their college of registration.